



NI MADE DIANA ERFIANI <dianaerfiani@undhirabali.ac.id>

[HN] Editor Decision

1 message

Nurman Kholis <nurmankholis@gmail.com>
To: Mrs Diana Erfiani <dianaerfiani@undhirabali.ac.id>
Cc: heritage@kemenag.go.id

Wed, May 13, 2020 at 6:49 PM

Mrs Diana Erfiani:

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Heritage of Nusantara: International Journal of Religious Literature and Heritage, "Semiotic Role in Translating Symbolic Religious Texts".

Our decision is to:

Nurman Kholis
Center for Research and Development of Religious Literature and Heritage,
Agency for Research and Development and Training Ministry of Religious
Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, Indonesia
nurmankholis@gmail.com

Reviewer B:

1. Is the paper content original?:
Yes
2. Does the paper title represent its content?:
3. Does the abstract reflect the paper content?:
4. Do the keywords indicate the scope of the research?:
5. Is the research methodology or the approach of the problem solving clearly described?:
6. Do the data presentation and interpretation valid and reasonable?:
7. Do the use of tables and figures help to clarify the explanation?:
8. Have the discussion and/or analysis been relevant with the results of the study?:
9. Are the references used relevant?:
10. Contribution to science:
Very good
11. Originality:
12. Systematic:
13. Language:
14. Writing accuracy:
15. This paper::
could be published with major revision
16. Do you want your name, as reviewer, released to the author(s)?:
No
17. Comment about the paper:
Setelah membaca naskah ini saya menyarankan untuk dimuat dengan "meJOR revision". Perbaikan terkait dengan konsep "interpretan" dan "proses penerjemahan". Bagaimana penulis sampai pada "kesimpulan" bahwa interpretasi dalam bentuk "legisign" itu salah. Perlu dipertajam secara konseptual pengertian "legisign"nya. Peircean sebagai sebuah interpretasi 'final' atau arhumentatif atau semata hanya sebuah interpretasi 'terbuka' yang bisa salah bisa benar, kalau 'legisign' salah apakah karena interpretasinya atau karena konfigurasi proporsinya yang salah? Mengingat hal ini penting dalam dunia semiotik,

sebelum diterbitkan, perlu ada penjelasan dulu atau jawaban atas pertanyaan tersebut

Reviewer C:

1. Is the paper content original?:
Yes
2. Does the paper title represent its content?:
Yes
3. Does the abstract reflect the paper content?:
Yes
4. Do the keywords indicate the scope of the research?:
Yes
5. Is the research methodology or the approach of the problem solving clearly described?:
Yes
6. Do the data presentation and interpretation valid and reasonable?:
Yes
7. Do the use of tables and figures help to clarify the explanation?:
Yes
8. Have the discussion and/or analysis been relevant with the results of the study?:
Yes
9. Are the references used relevant?:
Yes
10. Contribution to science:
Very good
11. Originality:
Good
12. Systematic:
Very good
13. Language:
Very good
14. Writing accuracy:
Very good
15. This paper::
could be published with minor revision
16. Do you want your name, as reviewer, released to the author(s)?:
Yes
17. Comment about the paper:
I found this script very interesting and written in good, straightforward and enlightening language. The initial part of the writing is quite sharp and long, but the findings and discussion section are still lacking in exploration. The reviewer suggests that the findings and discussion section can be expanded and extended (maybe 1 or 2 pages), as well as the end of the article before reaching a conclusion can be sharpened with several

paragraphs (maybe 1 page).

Overall, the reviewer believes that this manuscript is worthy of publication with minor changes.

And here are the notes from the reviewer:

1 - There is confusion between the correct use of the word TEXT or TEXTS, according to the context discussed. Please consult with an English linguist and make sure this text uses the right words and language.

2 - Some keywords are still written in Indonesian, not English. Please look at the reviewer notes.

3 - Please pay attention to some typos and placement of the writing method, so that it can be in accordance with the guidelines in the journal.

Heritage of Nusantara: International Journal of Religious Literature and Heritage (e-Journal)

<http://jurnallektur.kemenag.go.id/index.php/heritage>